

# STATE OF CONNECTICUT INSURANCE DEPARTMENT



# Property Casualty Insurance Rate Reviews For Calendar Year 2016

Katharine L. Wade Insurance Commissioner January 15, 2017 To:

Sen. Timothy Larson, Co-Chair, Insurance and Real Estate Committee

Sen. Kevin Kelly, Co-Chair, Insurance and Real Estate Committee

Rep. Sean Scanlon, Co-Chair, Insurance and Real Estate Committee

Rep. Robert Sampson, Ranking Member, Insurance and Real Estate Committee

I am pleased to present you with Connecticut Insurance Department's annual report of our review of property casualty rates in the state for calendar year 2016, pursuant to Connecticut General Statutes Section 38a-9(c).

The property casualty industry in Connecticut remains highly competitive in the state. Maintaining a competitive market is essential to the Department's mission of consumer protection. Hundreds of carriers are licensed to write P&C business in Connecticut, including some of the nation's largest carriers, which are headquartered here and have helped lead Connecticut to a No. 5 ranking nationally for P&C direct written premium.

It is essential that Connecticut citizens have access to numerous choices of plans and product that best suit their needs and household budgets. The Department strives to ensure that the products offered are priced fairly and are adequate for the coverage provided.

Some highlights of 2016 include:

- A decrease in worker's compensation insurance rates for the 3<sup>rd</sup> straight year
- Continued efforts to hold down homeowner's rate increases that have saved policyholders \$1.1 million in 2016 and \$58) million since 2012
- The Department completed a review of the <u>homeowner affordability</u> and <u>availability</u> and compiled the findings in a report.

If you should have any questions or would like to discuss any items in the report, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Respectfully,

Katharine L. Wade, Commissioner

Katharine L. Wade

Enclosure

Cc: Office of Legislative Research

# CONNECTICUT INSURANCE DEPARTMENT PROPERTY & CASUALTY DIVISION SUMMARY OF RATE REVIEWS FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2016

# **Table of Contents**

# Page

4-7		Summary of Rate Reviews
9-11	Exhibit A	Private Passenger Auto Rate Filings
<b>12-14</b>	Exhibit B	Homeowners Rate Filings
<b>15-20</b>	Exhibit C	Workers' Compensation Filing Decision and Orders
21-29	Exhibit C-1	Workers' Compensation Filings –2016
30-34	Exhibit C-2	Workers' Compensation Filings – 2017
35-36	Exhibit D	Commercial Automobile Filings
37-38	Exhibit E	Commercial General Liability Filings
39	Exhibit F	Commercial Fire and Allied Filings
40-42	Exhibit G	Commercial Multi Peril and Businessowner's
43s	Exhibit H	All Other Commercial

# **Summary of 2016 Rate Reviews**

Connecticut Insurance Department Property & Casualty Division

#### How the rates were reviewed

The Department's P&C Division conducts actuarial reviews pursuant to competitive rating laws, which establish standard for regulation of personal risk insurance. The statutes rely on a competitive marketplace to establish and maintain reasonable rate levels. Rates may not be inadequate or unfairly discriminatory, e.g. charging different premiums for policyholders with similar exposures.

#### **Overall reviews**

In 2016, the P&C Division reviewed more than 5,661 rate, rule, form and guideline filings.

#### Lines of business reviewed

- Personal Automobile
- Homeowner's
- Workers Compensation
- Commercial Automobile
- Commercial General Liability
- Commercial Fire and Allied
- Commercial Multi-Peril/Businessowner's
- Miscellaneous

## A. Personal Automobile (Exhibit A)

There was an average overall rate increase of 4.4 percent, up from 3.1 percent in 2015.

Rate filings reviewed: The Department received and reviewed 80 rate filings from companies actively writing private passenger automobile coverage in Connecticut. These companies varied in their distribution of drivers, policy limits, coverage types, prior rate filing date, loss cost levels and cost trends.

**Flex rate filings:** Of the 80 filings, there were 18 flex rate filings submitted under the flex rating statutes (Public Acts 06-104, PA 09-217, PA 11-253, PA 13-167 and PA 15-185) in which prior approval is not required if the overall

aggregate change is -0.6% to +6%. All but four of the flex filings were for rate increases.

**File and Use:** Property damage liability and automobile physical damage coverages are "file and use," which means prior approval from the Department is not required.

# Statewide rate level change for 2016

- Liability = +6.4 percent (1.3 percentage points higher than 2015)
- Physical Damage = +0.8 percent
- Combined Total = +4.4 percent

### B. Homeowner's (Exhibit B)

The homeowner's savings of \$1,102,881 million in 2015 and \$58 million since 2012 are the result of the Department's increased scrutiny of rate requests that have been particularly aggressive along the shoreline the past few years.

The Department also conducted a study on affordability and availability of homeowner's insurance statewide with particular focus on the shoreline in the wake the damaging storms of 2011-12.

The report's findings determined that the homeowner market remains strong and competitive on the Connecticut coastline with 19 new carriers entering the market in the past few years. The report, "<u>The Study of the Connecticut Homeowner Insurance Market and Coastal Affordability and Availability</u>" was published on January 12, 2017 in the first quarter of 2017.

# Rate Filings Reviewed in 2016

- Homeowners rate filings recorded **64**
- Average increase requested **4.3 percent** (4.6 percent in 2015)
- Average increase Department allowed **4.2 percent** (4.0 percent in 2015)
- Number of flex rate filings 23
- Number of coastal rate filings reduced or unchanged -3
- Number of total rate filings reduced 6

# Savings to policyholders

- 2016 \$1.1 million
- 2015 \$6.2 million
- 2014 **\$20 million**
- 2013 **\$5.2 million**
- 2012 **\$26 million**

#### **Market Growth**

In 2015, the Department approved one homeowner filings for a new company entering the market - Narragansett. Two companies have introduced a new high value homeowner program to their portfolio – Ironshore and Nationwide Crestbrook.

#### **Market Notes**

Allstate is still not writing new property business in the state. However, Allstate filed a new homeowner program during the fourth quarter which is currently under review and will be open to new business. Agents are able to write homeowner business through an arrangement between Allstate and Homesite Insurance (American Family).

## C. Workers' Compensation (Exhibit C)

On Oct. 31, 2016, <u>Commissioner Wade approved a reduction</u> in overall workers' compensation rates for Connecticut. This marked the third straight year that rates have <u>decreased</u>. The Commissioner's order followed a 30-day public comment period on the filing and recommendations proposed by the National Council on Compensation Insurance (NCCI) for workers' compensation Insurance. The order resulted in:

- 10.9 percent overall <u>decrease</u> to loss costs (actual losses and claim adjustment expenses)
- 10.9 percent overall *decrease* in assigned risk

**Exhibit C** identifies each company adopting the rate changes. Companies adjust the industry loss cost for expenses, investment income and competitive deviations to the loss costs as permitted by state law – C.G.S. 38a-676.

# **D.** Commercial Automobile (Exhibit D)

Commercial Automobile, filings from the Insurance Services Office (ISO), are primary industry loss costs filings for both liability and physical damage coverage. These are loss costs only, no expenses are included.

In 2016, 38 companies or groups filed commercial automobile rates based on loss cost filings or independent rates. Companies adjust the industry loss cost for expenses, investment income and competitive deviations to the loss costs as permitted by state law – C.G.S. 38a-676.

## E. Commercial General Liability (Exhibit E)

In 2016, 38 companies filed commercial general liability rates based on various industry loss costs documents to implement revised loss costs modifiers or independent effective dates.

There were no requests in 2016 for rate change in Medical Malpractice for physicians and surgeons. Medical Malpractice insurance is a sub-line of Professional Liability.

## F. Other Commercial Lines (Exhibits F, G and H)

During 2016, the Department reviewed 88 company or group filings to adopt various industry loss costs documents. The breakdown of those filings are:

- 21 Fire and Allied Lines
- 66 Commercial Multiperil/Businessowner's
- 0 Burglary & Theft
- 1 Fidelity &Surety



**Pages 9-43** 

#### **EXHIBIT- A**

# Status of Private Passenger Auto Rate Filings (2016 Effective Dates)

Flex

		1 1CX		_		
	1	Filing	******	Approved	*****	
Company Name	Effective	Y/N		Phys		Premium
company Nume	Date New	17.13	Liability	Dam	Total	Written
21st Century North America Insurance Company	10/31/2016	N	6.5%	2.4%	5.1%	16,505,261
1st Century North America Insurance Company						
Prog 35	9/5/2016	N	4.5%	9.5%	6.0%	15,571,001
Allstate Fire and Casualty Insurance Company	12/29/2016	N	15.2%	0.0%	9.9%	208,476,642
Allstate Indemnity Company	1/31/2016	Υ	6.3%	0.0%	5.2%	
Allstate Indemnity Company	12/29/2016	N	10.6%	0.0%	8.9%	
total			17.6%	0.0%	14.6%	5,581,450
American Commerce Insurance Company	1/17/2016	N	7.2%	7.1%	7.1%	
American Commerce Insurance Company	5/22/2016	N	5.7%	4.2%	5.0%	
total			13.3%	11.6%	12.5%	68,757,782
Amica Mutual Insurance Company	9/1/2016	N	3.5%	0.5%	2.5%	101,644,769
Bankers Standard Insurance Company	9/12/2016	N	8.4%	1.5%	5.0%	14,531,012
California Casualty Indemnity Exchange	11/1/2016	N	-1.0%	-8.3%	-4.0%	2,025,278
Central Mutual Insurance Company	1/1/2016	N	4.3%	-3.4%	1.5%	10,260,566
Chubb National Insurance Company	9/26/2016	N	4.2%	5.8%	5.0%	8,189,376
CSAA Affinity Insurance Company	10/1/2016	N	8.7%	2.2%	6.6%	23,855,071
Dairyland Insurance Company	4/11/2016	N	2.7%	0.0%	2.5%	3,982,103
Economy Premier Assurance Company	6/30/2016	N	6.3%	-3.5%	2.0%	524,061
Electric Insurance Company	5/31/2016	N	4.0%	2.1%	3.0%	
Electric Insurance Company	10/1/2016	N	5.0%	0.0%	2.2%	
total			9.2%	2.1%	5.3%	7,083,894
Encompass Indemnity Company	9/22/2016	Υ	4.9%	-1.0%	3.2%	4,065,044
Esurance Insurance Company	4/6/2016	N	0.1%	-1.3%	5.0%	
Esurance Insurance Company	8/10/2016	N	1.3%	-2.4%	0.0%	
total			1.4%	-3.7%	5.0%	28,607,930
Federal Insurance Company	9/26/2016	N	4.2%	5.8%	5.0%	2,431,942
Foremost Insurance Company Grand Rapids,						
Michigan	7/7/2016	N	8.9%	3.8%	8.1%	9,742,938
Garrison Property and Casualty Insurance						
Company	12/12/2016	N	25.0%	8.7%	18.0%	10,303,407
GEICO General Insurance Company	2/18/2016	Υ	6.1%	-1.5%	3.1%	226,819,805
GEICO Indemnity Company	2/18/2016	Υ	4.7%	-4.5%	1.7%	139,774,099
Government Employees Insurance Company	2/18/2016	Υ	6.1%	-1.5%	3.1%	49,120,531
Graphic Arts Mutual Insurance Company	8/21/2016	Υ	7.9%	-1.0%	5.0%	3,110,480
	†	l				

9/26/2016

9/15/2016

**Great Northern Insurance Company** 

Hartford Casualty Insurance Company

5.0%

4.0%

2,026,014

10,588,415

5.8%

-5.7%

4.2%

8.9%

Hartford Underwriters Insurance Company	10/7/2016	Υ	8.8%	-0.3%	5.9%	2,862,904
Horace Mann Insurance Company	9/1/2016	N	6.0%	0.9%	3.9%	236,023
Horace Mann Property and Casualty Insurance						
Company	9/1/2016	N	6.0%	0.9%	3.9%	1,180,958
IDS Property Casualty Insurance Company	8/27/2016	N	35.1%	22.5%	30.5%	8,775,030
Integon National Insurance Company	8/11/2016	N	3.5%	3.5%	3.5%	17,921,463
Kemper Independence Insurance Company	12/22/2016	N	5.3%	-8.2%	0.1%	9,218,047
LM General Insurance Company	2/1/2016	Υ	5.8%	0.0%	3.0%	
LM General Insurance Company	11/14/2016	Υ	5.2%	0.0%	3.1%	
total			11.3%	0.0%	6.2%	102,737,231
LM Insurance Corporation	2/1/2016	Υ	5.8%	0.0%	3.0%	
LM Insurance Corporation	11/14/2016	Υ	5.2%	0.0%	3.1%	
total			11.3%	0.0%	6.2%	5,486,270
Metropolitan Casualty Insurance Company	3/31/2016	Υ	5.6%	0.0%	4.0%	2,570,613
Metropolitan Group Property and Casualty						
Insurance Company	3/31/2016	Ν	3.2%	2.8%	3.0%	50,574,136
Metropolitan Property and Casualty Insurance						
Company	3/31/2016	Υ	5.6%	0.0%	4.0%	43,059,092
Mid-Century Insurance Company	3/7/2016	N	3.2%	14.1%	6.5%	
Mid-Century Insurance Company	9/5/2016	N	6.7%	6.2%	6.5%	
total			10.1%	21.2%	13.4%	8,677,000
National General Insurance Company	3/11/2016	N	12.7%	-1.1%	5.8%	
National General Insurance Company	12/17/2016	N	7.4%	7.6%	7.5%	
total			21.0%	6.4%	13.7%	1,248,559
Nationwide General Insurance Company.	8/28/2016	N	9.7%	5.8%	8.3%	51,218,443
Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company.	8/28/2016	N	6.8%	-1.7%	4.1%	54,402,603
Nationwide Property and Casualty Insurance						
Company.	8/28/2016	N	6.8%	-1.7%	4.1%	4,061
NGM Insurance Company	8/10/2016	N	3.5%	3.5%	3.5%	6,668,490
Pacific Indemnity Company	9/26/2016	N	4.2%	5.8%	5.0%	21,412,666
Pacific Insurance Company Limited	9/15/2016	N	8.2%	-6.2%	2.4%	51,431,923
Patrons Mutual Insurance Company of						
Connecticut	4/28/2016	Ν	2.9%	0.3%	1.9%	34,089,443
Pharmacists Mutual Insurance Company	12/15/2016	N	3.5%	8.7%	5.4%	15,652
Plymouth Rock Assurance Corporation	3/15/2016	Υ	7.4%	3.3%	5.9%	
Plymouth Rock Assurance Corporation	7/17/2016	N	3.4%	2.7%	3.1%	
total			11.1%	6.1%	9.2%	1,001,208
Privilege Underwriters Reciprocal Exchange	10/24/2016	N	8.7%	11.4%	9.9%	4,419,130
Progressive Casualty Insurance Company	5/20/2016	N	-0.4%	1.2%	0.0%	54,623,910
Progressive Direct Insurance Company	5/20/2016	N	0.2%	-0.4%	0.0%	
Progressive Direct Insurance Company	9/23/2016	Υ	3.1%	0.0%	2.1%	
total			3.3%	-0.4%	2.1%	51,174,007
Quincy Mutual Fire Insurance Company	9/1/2016	N	11.6%	-9.8%	3.6%	9,746,250

Regent Insurance Company	7/23/2016	Υ	5.5%	3.4%	4.8%	494,620
Republic-Franklin Insurance Company	8/21/2016	Υ	7.2%	-2.4%	3.6%	654,206
Safeco Insurance Company of Illinois	5/26/2016	N	12.2%	2.4%	8.5%	
Safeco Insurance Company of Illinois	10/20/2016	N	2.2%	-0.1%	1.5%	
total			14.7%	2.3%	10.1%	125,369,659
Sentinel Insurance Company Limited	9/15/2016	N	8.9%	-5.7%	4.0%	19,190,806
Teachers Insurance Company	9/1/2016	N	6.0%	0.9%	3.9%	4,247,058
The Cincinnati Insurance Company	4/1/2016	N	2.6%	3.8%	3.1%	364,599
The Hanover American Insurance Company	10/1/2016	N	4.9%	0.1%	3.0%	41,351,235
The Standard Fire Insurance Company	1/29/2016	N	4.1%	1.6%	3.0%	
The Standard Fire Insurance Company	10/21/2016	N	0.1%	-0.1%	0.0%	
total			4.2%	1.5%	3.0%	103,444,168
Trumbull Insurance Company	9/15/2016	N	8.2%	-6.2%	2.4%	2,199,260
United Ohio Insurance Company	4/1/2016	Υ	5.9%	2.8%	4.7%	359,753
United Services Automobile Association	12/12/2016	N	7.3%	4.2%	6.0%	34,660,523
Unitrin Direct Insurance Company	7/15/2016	N	7.9%	2.6%	6.1%	665,123
USAA Casualty Insurance Company	12/12/2016	N	8.6%	4.6%	7.0%	42,387,438
USAA General Indemnity Company	12/12/2016	N	27.0%	1.2%	15.0%	23,244,534
Utica Mutual Insurance Company	9/16/2016	N	15.7%	10.7%	13.9%	8,520,233
Victoria Fire and Casualty Company	4/11/2016	N	4.4%	0.0%	3.7%	
Victoria Fire and Casualty Company	9/12/2016	N	3.5%	0.0%	2.8%	
total			8.1%	0.0%	6.6%	7,931,447
Total			8.6%	1.1%	5.9%	1,975,487,198
companies with no rate changes			0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	689,551,802
State Total			6.4%	0.8%	4.4%	2,665,039,000
1/10/2017 10:34						

Status of CT Homeowners Rate Filings (2016 Effective dates)

2016 HOMEOWNERS						
Status of CT Homeowners Rate Filings						
(1)		(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	
COMPANY	Flex	EFFECTIVE	2015*	MARKET	2016	2016
	Filing	DATE	WRITTEN	SHARE	FILED	FINAL RATE
Alletete le demonite (Al)	Y/N	00/05/40	PREMIUM	0.00/	OVERALL 5.00/	RECORDED
Allstate Indemnity (AI)	N	06/25/16	3,207,113	0.2%	5.8%	5.8%
Allstate Ins Co. (AIC)	N	06/25/16	87,517,304	6.3%	0.4%	0.4%
Allstate Ins Co. (AIC)	N	08/11/16	4,060,456	0.3%	9.7%	9.7%
Allstate_Encompass Indemnity	Υ	09/22/16	4,171,379	0.3%	5.8%	5.8%
Allstate_Encompase Ins Co of America	Υ	09/22/16	3,715,849	0.3%	5.9%	5.9%
Am Trust_Integon Nat'l Ins Co.	Υ	08/11/16	19,113,984	1.4%	5.0%	5.0%
American Commerce Insurance Company	N	02/29/16	7,936,151	0.6%	8.1%	8.1%
American Commerce Insurance Company	N	11/25/16	47,623,153	3.4%	6.9%	6.9%
American Strategic Ins Co.	Υ	11/13/16	11,560,183	0.8%	6.0%	6.0%
Amica Mutual Insurance Company	Υ	05/16/16	63,673,352	4.6%	3.0%	3.0%
Andover_Cambridge Mutual Fire Insurance Company	Υ	09/15/16	5,951,610	0.4%	5.9%	5.9%
Andover_Merrimack Mutual Fire Insurance Company	Υ	09/15/16	17,386,315	1.2%	5.9%	5.9%
Bunker Hill	N	01/01/16	7,231,322	0.5%	8.0%	8.0%
Central Mutual Insurance Company	N	01/01/16	7,866,802	0.6%	2.9%	2.9%
Covenant Insurance Company	N	01/01/16	16,835,223	1.2%	7.6%	6.0%
CSAA Fire & Casualty Insurance Company	Υ	10/15/16	14,857,833	1.1%	5.9%	5.9%
Electric Ins Co	N	03/15/16	5,922,432	0.4%	2.5%	2.5%
Farm Family	N	02/01/16	2,889,921	0.2%	9.9%	9.9%
Farmers_Truck Ins. Co	Υ	02/16/16	2,001,000	0.1%	5.6%	5.6%
The Hanover Insurance Company	N	07/15/16	779,704	0.1%	4.4%	4.4%
Massachusetts Bay Insurance Company	N	07/15/16	19,932,824	1.4%	1.0%	1.0%
Citizens Insurance Company of America	N	07/15/16	5,883,367	0.4%	4.8%	4.8%
Harleysville Preferred Insurance Company	N	05/08/16	7,874,256	0.6%	7.5%	5.0%
Harleysville Worcester Insurance Company	N	05/08/16	414,228	0.0%	7.7%	5.0%
Hartford Casualty	N	12/10/16	873,537	0.1%	2.1%	2.1%
Hartford Insurance Co of the Southeast	N	12/10/16	6,840,866	0.5%	2.1%	2.1%
Hartford_Accident and Indemnity	N	12/10/16	4,092,703	0.3%	2.2%	2.2%
Hartford_Trumbull	N	12/10/16	10,984,317	0.8%	2.2%	2.2%
Homesite Insurance Co.	N	07/28/16	34,605,955	2.5%	8.5%	8.5%
Homesite_21st Century Premier Ins Co.	N	07/28/16	150,582	0.0%	7.6%	7.6%
Horace Mann Insurance Company	N	08/01/16	394,540	0.0%	5.1%	5.1%

**EXHIBIT-B** 

Horace Mann_Teachers	N	08/01/16	2,426,600	0.2%	10.7%	10.7%
IDS Property Casualty Insurance Co	N	02/20/16	6,336,612	0.5%	5.5%	5.5%
Integon National Ins Co	N	04/16/16	6,993,012	0.5%	11.0%	7.4%
Kemper_Kemper Ins. Co	N	12/22/16	6,921,204	0.5%	8.0%	8.0%
Kemper_Merastar	Υ	09/30/16	27,917	0.0%	4.9%	4.9%
Kemper_Unitrin Preferred	Υ	10/01/16	2,129,553	0.2%	6.0%	6.0%
Liberty Insurance Corp.	Υ	11/09/16	54,048,465	3.9%	4.0%	4.0%
Liberty Mutual Fire Ins. Co.	Υ	06/15/16	54,666,836	3.9%	4.0%	4.0%
Liberty Mutual Insurance Corp	Υ	11/09/16	4,191,982	0.3%	4.0%	4.0%
Liberty_General Insurance Company of America	Υ	07/09/16	38,809,056	2.8%	4.9%	4.9%
Liberty_Safeco Insurance Company of America	Υ	07/09/16	1,986,280	0.1%	4.9%	4.9%
Liberty_Safeco Legacy_Insurance Compar of America_	Υ	08/30/16	19,764,454	1.4%	4.8%	4.8%
Liberty_The First Liberty Ins Corp	Υ	06/15/16	0	0.0%	4.0%	4.0%
Metropolitan Group Property and Casualty Insurance Company	Υ	04/30/16	18,910,249	1.4%	3.4%	3.4%
Narragansett Bay Insurance Company	N	10/05/16	47,394	0.0%	-42.9%	-42.9%
Nationwide General Insurance Company.	Υ	08/27/16	9,652,970	0.7%	4.7%	4.7%
Nationwide Mutual Fire Insurance Compan	Υ	08/27/16	18,527,344	1.3%	5.2%	5.2%
Nationwide Property and Casualty Insurance Company.	Υ	08/27/16	31,691,265	2.3%	5.4%	5.4%
NGM Insurance Company	N	08/29/16	13,295,655	1.0%	2.0%	2.0%
Patrons Mutual Ins Co.	Υ	11/23/16	16,642,321	1.2%	5.6%	5.6%
Providence Mutual Fire Insurance Compa	Υ	01/01/16	5,069,546	0.4%	5.5%	5.5%
PURE_Privilaged Underwriters Reciprical Exchange	N	10/22/16	14,918,231	1.1%	5.0%	5.0%
QBE_General Casualty Company of Wisconsin	N	07/01/16	4,865,241	0.3%	8.4%	8.4%
State Farm Fire and Casualty Company	N	08/15/16	62,302,513	4.5%	1.5%	1.5%
United Property & Casualty Insurance Co	N	07/01/16	0	0.0%	-17.9%	-17.9%
Universal North America Insurance Compa	N	03/01/16	492,720	0.0%	15.0%	15.0%
Universal North American	N	02/01/16	9,640,832	0.7%	15.0%	15.0%
USAA Casualty Insurance Company	N	06/20/16	27,778,538	2.0%	0.0%	0.0%
USAA General Indemnity Company	N	06/20/16	7,316,535	0.5%	12.0%	6.9%
USAA_Garrison Property and Casualty Insurance Co	N	06/20/16	462,087	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
USAA_United Services Automobile Association	N	06/20/16	30,874,903	2.2%	0.0%	0.0%
Utica National_Graphic Arts Mutual	N	12/16/16	1,027,516	0.1%	7.0%	7.0%
Utica National_Republic-Franklin Insurance Company	N	11/16/16	5,869,371	0.4%	11.9%	11.9%
Vermont Mutual	N	02/01/16	13,608,197	1.0%	9.1%	9.1%

Total		917,643,660	4.3%	4.2%
companies with no rate change		478,479,340	0.0%	0.0%
State Total		1,396,123,00	2.8%	2.8%

7,035 C 8,000 3 7,304 6 8,696 C		A.2% \$1, 0.0% 2.8% 4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8%	emium avings 102,296 236,516
Change	4.3% 0.0% 2.8% 4.6% 0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	A.2% \$1, 0.0% 2.8% 4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8% 4.8% \$19 0.0%	102,296 236,516
7,035 7,035 3,000 7,035 7,035 8,000 3 7,304 6,696	4.3% 0.0% 2.8% 4.6% 0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	4.2% \$1, 0.0% 2.8% 4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8% \$19	102,296 236,516
7,035 3,000 0,965 7,035 8,000 3 7,304 6,696	0.0% 2.8% 4.6% 0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	0.0% 2.8% 4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8% 4.8% \$19	236,516
3,000 0,965 7,035 8,000 3,304 6,696	2.8% 4.6% 0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	2.8% 4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8% 4.8% \$19 0.0%	
7,035 C 8,000 3 7,304 6 8,696 C	4.6% 0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	4.0% \$6, 0.0% 2.8% 4.8% \$19	
7,035 C 8,000 3 7,304 6 8,696 C	0.0% 3.2% 6.8% 0.0%	0.0% 2.8% 4.8% \$19 0.0%	
8,000 3 7,304 6 8,696 0	6.8% 0.0%	2.8% 4.8% \$19 0.0%	,533,251
7,304 6 8,696 0	6.8%	4.8% <b>\$19</b> 0.0%	,533,251
3,696	0.0%	0.0%	,533,251
·			
6,000 5	5.2%	3.7%	
5,399 8	8.5%	7.9% \$5,	176,838
,601	0.0%	0.0%	
2,000	6.0%	5.6%	
,419 1	12.4%	9.7% \$25	,869,980
,581 (	0.0%	0.0%	
7,000 1	10.4%	8.1%	
		\$57	,918,881
9	9,581	9,581 0.0%	9,581 0.0% 0.0% 87,000 10.4% 8.1%

#### **EXHIBIT-C**

In the Matter of:

The National Council on Compensation Insurance, Inc.'s Workers' Compensation Voluntary Loss Costs and Assigned Risk Rates Filing, Effective January 1, 2017

\_\_\_\_\_\_

#### **MEMORANDUM AND ORDER**

#### I. INTRODUCTION

On September 22, 2016, the National Council on Compensation Insurance, Inc. ("NCCI") filed a workers' compensation insurance application with the Connecticut Insurance Department (the "Department") for a change in Voluntary Market Advisory Pure Premium Loss Costs and a change in Assigned Risk Plan Rates for Workers' Compensation Insurance pursuant to Conn. Gen. Stat. §38a-665(a) proposed to be effective January 1, 2017.

The filing requests revisions of the current loss costs and assigned risk rates that the Department approved effective January 1, 2016. NCCI proposes an overall -10.9% change for pure premium loss costs and an overall -10.9% change in assigned risk plan rates. Changes to individual classification costs have been limited to 20% of the industry group change.

In order to give the public an opportunity to comment on NCCI's filing, the Department published the filing and Executive Summary on its webpage on September 26, 2016 at: <a href="http://www.ct.gov/cid/cwp/view.asp?Q=585996&A=1270">http://www.ct.gov/cid/cwp/view.asp?Q=585996&A=1270</a> and provided a thirty (30) day period for the public and interested parties to review and comment on the filing. The Department did not receive any public comments and did not hold a public hearing.

The following sections are a review of the NCCI filing requests; Insurance Department Staff's recommendations; and my determination regarding approval of the filing.

#### II. NCCI FILING REQUESTS

1. NCCI's proposed changes in Voluntary Market Advisory Loss Costs reflects the following pure premium level changes:

Industry Group	Voluntary Market
	Pure Premium Advisory
	Loss Costs
	Change (%)
Manufacturing	-12.1%
Contracting	-12.7%
Office & Clerical	-12.2%
Goods & Services	-9.1%
Miscellaneous	-10.7%
Overall Change	-10.9%
Requested	

2. The proposed change in Assigned Risk Plan Rates reflects the following rate level changes:

Industry Group	Assigned Risk Plan
	Rate Change (%)
Manufacturing	-12.1%
Contracting	-12.7%

Office & Clerical	-12.2%
Goods & Services	-9.1%
Miscellaneous	-10.7%
Overall Change	-10.9%
Requested	

3. The components of the Advisory Loss Costs and Assigned Risk Plan Rate changes are comprised of the following elements:

Component	Voluntary Market Pure Premium  Change (%)	Assigned Risk Plan Premium Level Change (%)
Experience, Trend	-11.8%	-11.8%
Benefits	+0.7%	+0.7%
Loss-based Expenses	+0.3%	+0.3%
Change in Assigned Risk Multiplier	N/A	+0.0%
Overall Change Requested	-10.9%	-10.9%

- 4. The assessments due from employers for funding the cost of the Workers' Compensation Commission are 2.62% of losses. Insurance carriers pass through these assessments to employers. For the Voluntary Market and the Assigned Risk Plan, the assessment rate converted to a percentage of premium is 1.8% of standard premium. The assessment rate for "F" classifications, which provides coverage under the United States Longshore and Harbor Workers' Compensation Act and its extensions, is changing to 6.4% of total losses, with a proposed assessment on assigned risk standard premium and voluntary market standard premium of 3.7%.
- 5. The filing proposes to increase the maximum payroll for Executive Officers or Members of Limited Liability Companies from \$2,500 per week to \$2,600 per week.

- 6. The filing proposes to increase the maximum payroll for Athletic Teams from \$1,250 per week to \$1,300 per week.
- 7. The Average Weekly Wage on October 1, 2016 changed to \$1,292. NCCI estimates the impact of this change to be +0.8% on indemnity benefits.
- 8. Connecticut's Ambulatory Surgical Center Fee Schedule and Practitioner Fee Schedule were revised effective April 1, 2016 and July 15, 2016 respectively. NCCI estimates the impact of these changes to be +0.5% on medical benefits.
- 9. The filing proposes to increase the Permissible Loss Ratio for the Assigned Risk Rate filing from 69.0% to 69.7%.
- 10. The filing proposes no change to the currently approved \$160 expense constant.
- 11. The filing proposes to decrease the Uncollectible Premium Provision from 4.1% to 3.5%.

#### III. DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### A. Overall Advisory Loss Costs and Assigned Risk Plan Rates

Conn. Gen. Stat. §38a-665 establishes the standards, methods and criteria for the making and use of workers' compensation insurance rates in Connecticut. Conn. Gen. Stat. §38a-665 provides that no rates shall be excessive or inadequate, nor shall they be unfairly discriminatory. Conn. Gen. Stat. §38a-665(b) provides that consideration shall be given, to the extent possible, to: past and prospective loss experience; reasonable margin for profit and contingencies; past and prospective expenses both countrywide and those specially applicable to this state; investment income earned or realized both from unearned premium and loss reserve funds; and other relevant factors, including judgment factors.

The Department's staff determined that overall cost levels are decreasing for the assigned risk rates and for the voluntary market advisory loss costs. The cost levels for this filing are based on Connecticut loss experience for policy years 2013 and 2014. NCCI adjusts past losses to current conditions using adjustment methods, which make the magnitude of the change very sensitive to their assumptions. Critical assumptions include those for trend, loss development and experience period. Department staffs reviewed the assumptions included in these filings for reasonableness, including the econometric forecast values and recommend the following:

#### B. Assigned Risk Differential

The filing proposes to increase the Assigned Risk Differential from 27.5% to 30%.

#### C. Maximum Payroll for Executive Officers or Members of Limited Liability Companies

The filing proposes to increase the maximum payroll for Executive Officers or Members of Limited Liability Companies from \$2,500 per week to \$2,600 per week. Department staffs believe this requested increase is reasonable and will make the maximum payroll used in Connecticut responsive to the state's economy.

#### IV. ORDERS

On the basis of the foregoing recommendations and analysis by Department staff and my review of the filing, I hereby order that:

- A. NCCI's Assigned Risk Plan rates and voluntary market advisory loss costs are accepted as filed.
- B. The proposed decrease in the uncollectible premiums for the assigned risk plan from 4.1% to 3.5% is approved.
- C. The proposed increase in the Assigned Risk Differential from 27.5% to 30% is approved.
- D. The proposed increase in the Permissible Loss Ratio for the Assigned Risk Rate filing from 69.0% to 69.7% is approved.
- E. The proposed increase in the maximum payroll for Executive Officers or Members of Limited Liability Companies from \$2,500 per week to \$2,600 per week is approved.
- F. The proposed increase in the maximum payroll for Athletic Teams from \$1,250 per week to \$1,300 per week is approved.
- G. The proposed Workers' Compensation Commission industrial classification assessment fund rate be changed to 1.8% of standard premium and "F" industrial classification assessment fund rate be changed to 3.7% of standard premium for voluntary market and assigned risk plan insurers for policies effective on or after January 1, 2017.

	g requirement set forth in Conn. Gen. Stat. §38a-676(b) for filings be waived in order to allow for the adoption of the change in advisory January 1, 2017.
Dated at Hartford, Cor	nnecticut this 31 day of October, 2016
	See Signature on file
	Katharine L. Wade
	Insurance Commissioner

# **EXHIBIT- C-1**

ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR	RATE
			CHANGE
		2016	
NCCI			
	CAROLINA CASUALTY INS CO		-3.9
	MIDWEST EMPLOYERS CASUALTY CO		
	STARNET INS CO		-3.9
	INS CO OF THE WEST		-3.9
	ACADIA INS CO - STANDARD		-1.3
	ACADIA INS CO - PREFERRED		
	CONTINTENTAL WESTERN INS CO - STANDARD		
	CONTINTENTAL WESTERN INS CO - PREFERRED		
	FIREMEN'S INS CO OF WASHINGTON, D.C STANDARD		
	FIREMEN'S INS CO OF WASHINGTON, D.C PREFERRED		
	UNION INS CO - STANDARD		
	UNION INS CO - PREFERRED		
	ADMIRAL INDEMNITY CO - STANDARD		
	CLERMONT INS CO - STANDARD		
	T.H.E. INS CO		-3.9
	FEDERATED MUTUAL INS CO		-7.2
	FEDERATED SERVICE INS CO		1.7
	FRANK WINSTON CRUM INS CO		-3.9
	BROTHERHOOD MUTUAL INS CO		-2.5
	TRANSGUARD INS CO OF AMERICA INC		-7.9
	WESCO INS CO		-7.9
	TECHNOLOGY INS CO		
	SECURITY NATIONAL INS CO		
	NATIONAL LIABILITY & FIRE INS CO		-3.9
			0.0
	OLD REPUBLIC GENERAL INS CORP		-3.9
			3.0
	FLORISTS MUTUAL INS CO		-4.0
	1 20 MOTO MOTO AE MO		-7.0
	OLD REPUBLIC INS CO		-3.9
	OLD ILLI ODLIG ING GO		-3.3
	BERKLEY NATIONAL INS CO		-4.1
	DERIVEE I MATIONAL ING CO		-⊶. I

BERKLEY REGIONAL INS CO	
TRI-STATE INS CO OF MINNESOTA	
RIVERPORT INS CO	
VANLINER INS CO	-14.15
NATIONAL INTERSTATE INSURANCE	-3.3
TRIUMPHE CASUALTY COMPANY	0
MARKEL INS CO	-3.40
PHARMACISTS MUTUAL INS CO	-1.1
STARR INDEMNITY & LIABILITY COMPANY	-3.0
FIRSTCOMP INS CO	-1.40
GUIDEONE MUTUAL INS CO	-1.4
AMERICAN HOME ASSURANCE CO	-3.9
AIG ASSURANCE CO	
AIG PROPERTY CASUALTY CO	
COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY INS CO	
GRANITE STATE INSURANCE CO	
ILLINOIS NATIONAL INSURANCE	
NATIONAL UNION FIRE INS CO OF PITTSBURGH, PA	
NEW HAMPSHIRE INS CO	
INSURANCE COMPANY OF THE STATE OF PA	
AIU INS CO	
ACIG INS CO	-2.41
PREFERRED PROFESSIONAL INS CO	-3.9
PUBLIC SERVICE INS CO	13.7
FRANKENMUTH MUTUAL INS CO	-3.9
ANSUR AMERICA INS CO	
RLI INS CO Tier I	-9.8
 Tier II	
 Tier III	
ACE AMERICAN INS CO	-2.5
 INDEMNITY INS CO OF NORTH AMERICA	
INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA	
WESTCHESTER FIRE INS CO	
ACE FIRE UNDERWRITERS INS CO	
ACE PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	
BANKERS STANDARD INS CO	

PACIFIC EMPLOYERS INS CO	
GREAT WEST CASUALTY COMPANY	5.1
MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - standard tier	-3.9
 MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - preferred tier	
MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - safety tier	
MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - standard tier	-3.9
MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - preferred tier	
MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - safety tier	
ACCIDENT FUND GENERAL INS CO	-6.9
ACCIDENT FUND NATIONAL INS CO	-5.9
ACCIDENT FUND INS CO OF AMERICA	-5.1
UNITED WISCONSIN INS CO	-1.1
LIBERTY MUTUAL INS CO	-2.2
 LIBERTY MUTUAL FIRE INS CO	
 LM INSURANCE CORP	
FIRST LIBERTY INSURANCE CORP	
LIBERTY INSURANCE CORP	
EMPLOYERS INS OF WAUSAU	
WAUSAU UNDERWRITERS INS CO	
CINCINNATI INSURANCE COMPANY	-6.10
CINCINNATI CASUALTY COMPANY	-0.10
CINCINNATI CASGALTI COMPANY  CINCINNATI INDEMNITY COMPANY	
MITSUI SUMITOMO INS CO OF AMERICA	
AIOI NISSAY DOWA INS CO OF AMERICA	-6.3
MITSUI SUMITOMO INS USA INC	-6.3
CALIFORNIA INS CO	-9.5
BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY HOMESTATE INS CO	-3.9
OAK RIVER INS CO	
 REDWOOD FIRE AND CASUALTY INS CO	
WORK FIRST CASUALTY CO	2.0
WORK FIRST CASUALITICO	-3.9
BITCO GENERAL INS CORP	-7.9
GREAT DIVIDE INS CO	1.5
XL SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY	-3.9
XL INS AMERICA	
GREENWICH INSURANCE COMPANY	
SENTEN CASHALTY CO	
SENTRY CASUALTY CO	0

	SELECTIVE INSURANCE CO OF THE SOUTHEAST	-0.1
	SELECTIVE INSURANCE CO OF SOUTH CAROLINA	3.0
_	SELECTIVE INSURANCE CO OF AMERICA	0.1
	BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY DIRECT INS CO	-3.9
	NATIONWIDE AGRIBUSINESS INS CO - Preferred	2.7
	NATIONWIDE AGRIBUSINESS INS CO - Standard	
	NATIONWIDE AGRIBUSINESS INS CO - Non-Standard	
	NATIONAL CASUALTY CO - Preferred	-5.5
	NATIONAL CASUALTY CO - Standard	
	NATIONAL CASUALTY CO - Non-Standard	
	FOREMOST INSURANCE COMPANY	-3.1
	FOREMOST PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	-6.0
	FOREMOST SIGNATURE INS CO	-5.3
	GREAT AMERICAN INS CO	-5.2
	GREAT AMERICAN ASSURANCE CO	
	GREAT AMERICAN INS CO OF NY	
	GREAT AMERICAN ALLIANCE INS CO	
	GREAT AMERICAN SPIRIT INS CO	
	SAFETY NATIONAL CASUALTY CORP	
	SAFETY FIRST INS CO	
	ZENITH INS CO	-3.9
	CHURCH MUTUAL INS CO	5.12
	EVEREST NATIONAL INS CO	-6.2
	EVEREST NATIONAL INS CO EVEREST REINSURANCE CO	-0.2
	FEDERAL INS CO	2.6
	CHUBB INDEMNITY INS CO	-3.6
	GREAT NORTHERN INS CO	
	PACIFIC INDEMNITY CO	
	VIGILANT INS CO	
	CHUBB NATIONAL INS CO	
	AMERICAN CASUALTY COMPANY OF READING PA	-5.4
	CONTINENTAL CASUALTY COMPANY	-5.4
	NATIONAL FIRE INS CO	
	CONTINENTAL INS CO	
	TRANSPORTATION INS CO	
	VALLEY FORGE INSURANCE CO	

MANUFACTURERS ALLIANCE INS CO	
PENNSYLVANIA MFG INDEMNITY CO	
AMERICAN ALTERNATIVE INS CORP	-3.9
AMERICAN FAMILY HOME INS CO	-3.9
AMERICAN MODERN HOME INS CO	-6.0
IMPERIUM INS CO	-3.9
GREAT MIDWEST INS CO	
SAMSUNG FIRE & MARINE INS CO, LTD, USB	-3.9
SAMSUNG FIRE & MARINE INS CO, LTD, USB	-3.9
HARTFORD FIRE INS CO	-4.84
HARTFORD CASUALTY INS CO	
HARTFORD ACCIDENT & INDEMNITY	
HARTFORD UNDERWRITERS INS CO	
TWIN CITY FIRE INS CO	
SENTINEL INS CO, LTD	
HARTFORD INS CO OF THE MIDWEST	
PACIFIC INSURANCE COMPANY, LTD	
TRUMBULL INS CO	
AMERICAN MINING INSURANCE COMPANY	-3.9
PROTECTIVE INSURANCE COMPANY	-7.0
UNITED STATES FIRE INS CO	1.0
NORTH RIVER INS CO	6.9
CRUM AND FORSTER INDEMNITY COMPANY	8.3
AMGUARD INS CO	-4.6
NORGUARD INS CO	-4.6
EASTGUARD INS CO	-6.4
 HARLEYSVILLE WORCESTER INS CO	-6.0
HARLEYSVILLE PREFERRED INS CO	0.0
HARLEYSVILLE INS CO	
NATIONWIDE MUTUAL INS CO HARLEYSVILLE OPERATION	
FIREMAN'S FUND INSURANCE CO	-3.0
THE AMERICAN INSURANCE CO	0.0
NATIONAL SURETY CORPORATION	

 ASSOCIATED INDEMNITY CORP	
AMERICAN AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE CO	
TRUCK INCURANCE EVOLUNIOS	7.0
TRUCK INSURANCE EXCHANGE	-7.0
KEY RISK INS CO	-3.9
ADVANTAGE WORKERS COMPENSATION INS CO	-11.9
TOKIO MARINE AMERICA INS CO	-3.4
 TRANS PACIFIC INS CO	-2.8
 AMEDICUDE MUTUAL INC CO	2.0
 AMERISURE MUTUAL INS CO  AMERISURE INS CO	-3.9
AWERISORE INS CO	
ZURICH AMERICAN INS CO	-7.0
AMERICAN GUARANTEE & LIABILITY INS CO	
AMERICAN ZURICH INS CO	
ZURICH AMERICAN INS CO OF IL	
FIDELITY AND DEPOSIT CO OF MD	
 COLONIAL AMERICAN CASUALTY & SURETY CO	
NGM INS CO	-2.0
MAIN STREET AMERICA ASSURANCE CO	0
HANOVER INSURANCE COMPANY	-4.0
MASSACHUSETTS BAY INSURANCE CO	-4.2
CITIZENS INSURANCE CO OF AMERICA	-4.8
ALLMERICA FINANCIAL BENEFIT INS CO	-3.1
 HANOVER AMERICAN INS CO	-5.2
HDI-GERLING AMERICA INS CO	-3.9
OBI NATIONAL INSURANCE CO - Standard Tier	-3.9
OBI NATIONAL INSURANCE CO - Preferred Tier	
OBI NATIONAL INSURANCE CO - Super Preferred Tier	
ATLANTIC SPECIALTY INS CO - Standard Tier	
ATLANTIC SPECIALTY INS CO - Preferred Tier	
ATLANTIC SPECIALTY INS CO - Super Preferred Tier	
NEW YORK MARINE AND GENERAL INS CO	-0.6
WESTPORT INS CORPORATION	-3.9
NORTH AMERICAN SPECIALTY INS CO	
NORTH AMERICAN ELITE INS CO	
AMERICAN COMPENSATION INS CO	14.0
STATE AUTO MUTUAL INS CO	-6.9

STATE AUTO PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	-5.1
PATRONS MUTUAL INS CO OF CT	-1.4
ARCH INS CO	-3.9
TRAVELERS INDEMNITY COMPANY	-4.8
TRAVELERS PROPERTY CASUALTY CO OF AMERICA	
CHARTER OAK FIRE INSURANCE CO	
TRAVELERS INDEMNITY CO OF AMERICA	
TRAVELERS INDEMNITY CO OF CT	
PHOENIX INSURANCE COMPANY	
TRAVELERS CASUALTY AND SURETY	
FARMINGTON CASUALTY COMPANY	
STANDARD FIRE INSURANCE COMPANY	
NOVA CASUALTY CO SUPERIOR TIER	-3.5
PREFERRED TIER	
STANDARD TIER	
SUBSTANDARD TIER	
NATIONAL AMERICAN INS CO	INITIAL
NATIONAL AMERICAN INC CO	IIIIIAL
BENCHMARK INS CO	INITIAL
OLD DOMINION INS CO	-1.7
PEERLESS INSURANCE COMPANY	-5.7
 EXCELSIOR INSURANCE COMPANY	
NETHERLANDS INSURANCE COMPANY	
PEERLESS INDEMNITY INSURANCE COMPANY	
THE OHIO CASUALTY INS CO	-4.7
OHIO SECURITY INSURANCE COMPANY	-4.7
WEST AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY	
AMERICAN FIRE & CASUALTY COMPANY	
AMERICAN FIRE & CASUALTY COMPANY	
PRAETORIAN INSURANCE COMPANY	-3.9
STONINGTON INS CO	
ALLIED PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	0.8
DEPOSITORS INS CO	-13.0
AMCO INS CO	3.9
 NATIONWIDE MUTUAL INS CO	2.0
 NATIONWIDE PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	-5.0
NATIONWIDE MUTUAL FIRE INS CO	2.0
AMERICAN CTATECING CO	
AMERICAN STATES INS CO	-2.

AMERICAN ECONOMY INS CO	
FIRST NATIONAL INS CO OF AMERICA	
GENERAL INS CO OF AMERICA	
GENERAL CASUALTY CO OF WISCONSIN	8.1
REGENT INSURANCE COMPANY	-2.9
FEDERATED MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY	5.9
FEDERATED SERVICE INSURANCE COMPANY	
ARBELLA INDEMNITY INS CO	-4.9
 PENN MILLERS INSURANCE COMPANY	-3.1
 SENTRY INS A MUTUAL CO	8.0
MIDDLESEX INS CO	9.4
PATRIOT GENERAL INS CO	-7.4
SENTRY SELECT INS CO	21.9
ARBELLA PROTECTION INS CO	15.7
	1011
OAK RIVER INS CO	-10.0
	1010
NORGUARD INSURANCE COMPANY	0.15
NONCOVILIS INCONVINCE COMM / INT	0.10
HARTFORD FIRE INS CO	1.9
HARTFORD CASUALTY INS CO	1.9
HARTFORD ACCIDENT & INDEMNITY	1.9
HARTFORD UNDERWRITERS INS CO	1.9
TWIN CITY FIRE INS CO	1.9
SENTINEL INS CO, LTD	1.9
HARTFORD INS CO OF THE MIDWEST	1.9
PACIFIC INSURANCE COMPANY, LTD	1.9
TRUMBULL INS CO	2.0
TROWING CO	2.0
STATE FARM FIRE AND CASUALTY CO	-2.1
STATE FARINI FIRE AND CASUALTY CO	-2.1
EMPLOYERS ASSURANCE CO	INITIAL
EMPLOYERS ASSURANCE CO  EMPLOYERS PREFERRED INS CO	INITIAL
EWIPLUTERS PREFERRED INS CO	INITIAL
ARGONAUT INS CO	0.4
ARGUNAUT INS CO	0.4
CTATE NATIONAL INC CO	4.0
STATE NATIONAL INS CO	1.8
OTAR MOURANCE COMPANY	
 STAR INSURANCE COMPANY	-2.5
AMGUARD INS CO	2.20
 EASTGUARD INS CO	2.49

FARM FAMILY CACHALTY INC CO	
FARM FAMILY CASUALTY INS CO	-0.3
EMPLOYERS MUTUAL CASUALTY CO	-3.1
EMCASCO INS CO	-5.2
EMPLOYERS COMPENSATION INS CO	INITIAL
SAGAMORE INS CO	0.0
GREATER NEW YORK MUTUAL INS CO	-8.1
INS CO OF GREATER NEW YORK	
STRATHMORE INS CO	
PROTECTIVE INSURANCE COMPANY	-10.0
OBI AMERICA INS CO	INITIAL
ASSOCIATED INDUSTRIES OF MA MUTUAL INS CO	-3.9
ASSOCIATED EMPLOYERS INS CO	
 ALLMERICA FINANCIAL ALLIANCE INS CO	INITIAL

# EXHIBIT- C- 2

ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR	RATE
		2017	CHANGE
NCCI			
	BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY DIRECT INS CO		-12.0
	FEDERATED MUTUAL INS CO		-9.9
	FEDERATED SERVICE INS CO		-3.7
	NATIONAL LIABILITY & FIRE INS CO		-11.2
	PREFERRED PROFESSIONAL INS CO		-10.9
	FRANK WINSTON CRUM INS CO		-15.8
	FLORISTS MUTUAL INS CO		-9.0
	AMERICAN CASUALTY COMPANY OF READING PA		-11.3
	CONTINENTAL CASUALTY COMPANY		11.0
	NATIONAL FIRE INS CO		
	CONTINENTAL INS CO		
	TRANSPORTATION INS CO		
	VALLEY FORGE INSURANCE CO		
	VALLET FORGE INSURANCE CO		
	WEOOD IND OO		40.0
	WESCO INS CO		-10.9
	TECHNOLOGY INS CO		
	SECURITY NATIONAL INS CO		
	OLD REPUBLIC INS CO		-10.9
	CALIFORNIA INS CO		-10.9
	AMERICAN COMPENSATION INS CO		-3.0
	STATE AUTO MUTUAL INS CO		-6.8
	STATE AUTO PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO		-5.7
	PATRONS MUTUAL INS CO OF CT		-12.5
	VANLINER INS CO		-16.9
	NATIONAL INTERSTATE INSURANCE CO		-3.6
	TRIUMPHE CASUALTY COMPANY		1.0
	OLD REPUBLIC GENERAL INS CORP		-10.9
	BITCO GENERAL INS CORP		-10.9
	19 99		1
	CAROLINA CASUALTY INS CO		-10.9
	C. I. C. LIVI C. CO. C. L. I. III C. C.		10.0
	FEDERAL INS CO		-3.2
	I EDERAL ING GO		-3.2

	CHUBB INDEMNITY INS CO	-4.1
(	GREAT NORTHERN INS CO	-8.1
F	PACIFIC INDEMNITY CO	-6.0
١	/IGILANT INS CO	-3.8
(	CHUBB NATIONAL INS CO	-4.1
5	STARR INDEMNITY & LIABILITY COMPANY	-8.0
V	WORK FIRST CASUALTY CO	-4.9
11	NS CO OF THE WEST	-10.9
n	MIDWEST EMPLOYERS CASUALTY CO	-10.9
1	FRANSGUARD INS CO OF AMERICA INC	-10.9
	IBERTY MUTUAL INS CO	-10.9
	LIBERTY MUTUAL FIRE INS CO	
	LM INSURANCE CORP	
=	LIBERTY INSURANCE CORP	
	EMPLOYERS INS CO OF WAUSAU	
	WAUSAU UNDERWRITERS INS CO	
E	BROTHERHOOD MUTUAL INS CO	-10.3
	AMERICAN MINING INSURANCE COMPANY	-10.9
	KEY RISK INS CO	-10.9
	<u></u>	1010
(	GREAT DIVIDE INS CO	-14.2
	AMERICAN HOME ASSURANCE CO	-2.0
Į.	AIG ASSURANCE CO	
A	AIG PROPERTY CASUALTY CO	
(	COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY INS CO	
(	GRANITE STATE INSURANCE CO	
I	LLINOIS NATIONAL INSURANCE	
N	NATIONAL UNION FIRE INS CO OF PITTSBURGH, PA	
N	NEW HAMPSHIRE INS CO	
	NSURANCE COMPANY OF THE STATE OF PA	
	AIU INS CO	
	FIREMAN'S FUND INSURANCE CO	-10.4
	THE AMERICAN INSURANCE CO	
	NATIONAL SURETY CORPORATION	
	ASSOCIATED INDEMNITY CORP	
	AMERICAN AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE CO	

PHARMACISTS MUTUAL INS CO	-0.7
UTICA MUTUAL INS COMPANY - STANDARD	-5.1
UTICA MUTUAL INS COMPANY - PREFERRED	-5.1
GRAPHIC ARTS MUTUAL INS COMPANY	-7.7
REPUBLIC-FRANKLIN INS COMPANY - SUPERIOR	-6.2
REPUBLIC-FRANKLIN INS COMPANY - PREMIER	-6.2
UTICA NATIONAL ASSURANCE COMPANY - TIER A	-5.1
UTICA NATIONAL ASSURANCE COMPANY - TIER B	-5.1
ACCIDENT FUND GENERAL INS CO	-3.3
ACCIDENT FUND NATIONAL INS CO	-4.5
ACCIDENT FUND INS CO OF AMERICA	-6.7
UNITED WISCONSIN INS CO	-9.5
PEERLESS INSURANCE COMPANY	-10.1
EXCELSIOR INSURANCE COMPANY	-11.1
NETHERLANDS INSURANCE COMPANY	-12.2
PEERLESS INDEMNITY INSURANCE COMPANY	-11.7
THE OHIO CASUALTY INS CO	-13.8
OHIO SECURITY INSURANCE COMPANY	-11.7
WEST AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY	-11.6
AMERICAN FIRE & CASUALTY COMPANY	-11.2
ACE AMERICAN INS CO	-12.1
INDEMNITY INS CO OF NORTH AMERICA	
INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA	
WESTCHESTER FIRE INS CO	
ACE FIRE UNDERWRITERS INS CO	
ACE PROPERTY & CASUALTY INS CO	
BANKERS STANDARD INS CO	
PACIFIC EMPLOYERS INS CO	
BERKLEY NATIONAL INS CO	-11.698
BERKLEY REGIONAL INS CO	
TRI-STATE INS CO OF MINNESOTA	
RIVERPORT INS CO	
ZURICH AMERICAN INS CO	-12.5
AMERICAN GUARANTEE & LIABILITY INS CO	
AMERICAN ZURICH INS CO	
ZURICH AMERICAN INS CO OF IL	
FIDELITY AND DEPOSIT CO OF MD	
COLONIAL AMERICAN CASUALTY & SURETY CO	
BENCHMARK INS CO	-10.9

	GREAT WEST CASUALTY COMPANY	-4.7
	MARKEL INS CO	-8.70
	FIRSTCOMP INS CO	-9.10
	FRANKENMUTH MUTUAL INS CO	-10.9
	ANSUR AMERICA INS CO	
	ASSOCIATED INDUSTRIES OF MA MUTUAL INS CO	-10.9
	ASSOCIATED EMPLOYERS INS CO	-10.9
	BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY HOMESTATE INS CO	-10.9
_	OAK RIVER INS CO	
	REDWOOD FIRE AND CASUALTY INS CO	
	AMERICAN ALTERNATIVE INS CORP	-10.9
	AMERICAN FAMILY HOME INS CO	-10.9
	AMERICAN MODERN HOME INS CO	-10.9
	IMPERIUM INS CO	-10.9
	GREAT MIDWEST INS CO	-10.9
	XL SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY	-10.9
	XL INS AMERICA	
	GREENWICH INSURANCE COMPANY	
	MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - standard tier	-13.11
	MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - preferred tier	
	MAINE EMPLOYERS' MUTUAL INS CO - safety tier	
	ACIG INS CO	-11.58
	MITSUI SUMITOMO INS CO OF AMERICA	-10.9
	AIOI NISSAY DOWA INS CO OF AMERICA	-10.9
	MITSUI SUMITOMO INS USA INC	-10.9
	EVEREST NATIONAL INS CO	-8.5
	EVEREST REINSURANCE CO	
	CHURCH MUTUAL INS CO	-9.9

SENTRY CASUALTY CO	0.0
PROTECTIVE INSURANCE COMPANY	-22.33
SAGAMORE INS CO	0.0
AMGUARD INS CO	-6.6
NORGUARD INS CO	-3.9
NORGUARD INS CO	-2.9
EASTGUARD INS CO	-5.7
GUIDEONE MUTUAL INS CO	-6.7
RLI INS CO Tier I	-6.9
Tier II	
Tier III	
AMERICAN STATES INS CO	-9.9
AMERICAN ECONOMY INS CO	
FIRST NATIONAL INS CO OF AMERICA	
GENERAL INS CO OF AMERICA	
TRUCK INSURANCE EXCHANGE	-10.9
ARCH INS CO	-10.9
MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - standard tier	-14.55
MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - preferred tier	
MEMIC INDEMNITY COMPANY - safety tier	

# **EXHIBIT- D**

LINE OF BUSINESS	COMMERCIAL AUTOMOBILE		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
ISO	Liberty Mutual Fire Ins. Co.		3.3
	The First Liberty Ins. Corp.		2.8
	Liberty Ins. Corp.		2.9
ISO	Hartford Accident and Indemnity Company		7
ISO	Government Employees Insurance Company		20.1
	United Ohio Insurance Company		8.4
ISO	Harleysville Insurance Company		8.8
	Harleysville Worcester Insurance Company		11.800
	Harleysville Preferred Insurance Company		2.3
ISO	North American Elite Ins. Co.		5
ISO	Charter Oak Fire Ins. Co.		6.3
100	Phoenix Ins. Co.		5.8
	Travelers Indemnity Co.		7.1
	Travelers indefinity co.  Travelers Indemnity of America		7.7
	Travelers Indemnity Co. of Connecticut		6.5
	Travelers Casualty Ins. Co. of America		-26.9
	Travelers Property Casualty Co. of America		6.5
ISO	Utica Mutual Ins. Co.		9.5
100	Graphic Arts Muutual Ins. Co.		9.2
	Republic-Franklin Ins. Co.		9.2
ISO	Selective Ins. Co. of America		2.4
130	Selective Ins. Co. of South Carolina		-3.1 -1.5
	Selective Ins. Co. of the Southeast		0.6
ISO	Hanover Ins. Co.		3.2
130	Massachusetts Bay Ins. Co.		3.9
	Citizens Ins. Co. of America		4.3
ISO	Sentinel Ins. Co. Ltd.		5
100	N		
ISO	Nationwide Mutual Fire Ins. Co,		3.3
	Nationwide Mutual Ins. Co.		3.3
	Nationwide Property & Casualty Ins. Co.		3.3
	Nationwide General Ins.Co.		3.3
ISO	NGM Ins. Co.		7.3

sualty Ins. Co Co. of the Midwest	10.3
	10.3
derwriters Ins. Co.	4.1
d Casualty Ins. Co. of Hartford	10.5
re Ins. Co.	9.8
e Ins. Co.	10.2
İ	d Casualty Ins. Co. of Hartford re Ins. Co. e Ins. Co.

# **EXHIBIT- E**

LINE OF BUSINESS	GENERAL LIABILITY		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
ISO/Independent	QBE Insurance Group		-0.09%
ISO/Independent	Greater New York Mutual Insurance Company		0.12%
	Insurance Company of Greater New York		
ISO	Hospitality Insurance Company		-6.10%
ISO/Independent	The Hanover Insurance Company		-4.20%
	Hanover Insurance Company of America		
	Massachusetts Bay Insurance Company		
	Citizens Insurance Company of America		
Independent	Zurich American Insurance Company		5.80%
Independent	Continental Casualty Company		11.00%
ISO/Independent	Sentry Insurance A Mutual Company		-7.30%
·	Middlesex Insurance Company		
	Patriot General Insurance Company		
Independent	Aspen American Insurance Company		-18.00%
Independent	Arbella Protection Insurance Company Inc.		-30.00%
ISO	Transguard Insurance Company of America, Inc.		4.20%
ISO/Independent	Nationwide Group of Companies		4.00%
ISO/Independent	Tri-State Insurance Company of Minnesota		1.90%
ISO/Independent	American Fire and Casualty Company		2.10%
	The Ohio Casualty Insurance Company		
	Ohio Security Insurance Company		
	West American Insurance Company		
ISO	Liberty Mutual Group of Companies		3.40%
ISO/Independent	Selective Insurance Company of America		-0.90%
	Selective Insurance Company of South Carolina		
	Selective Insurance Company of Southeast		
ISO	Hartford Group of Companies		3.60%

ISO	Markel American Ins Co	0.50%
ISO	Nova Casualty Co	4.20%
ISO/Independent	State Auto Insurance Group	0.40%
Independent	Hartford Insurance Group	-0.70%
ISO/Independent	Travelers Group of Companies	1.70%
ISO/Independent	Liberty Mutual Group of Companies	2.10%
ISO	Everest National Insurance Co Everest Reinsurance Co	0.90%
180	Federated Mutual Insurance Co	0.009/
ISO	Federated Service Insurance Co	0.09%
ISO	Hospitality Insurance Company	0.00%

# **EXHIBIT-F**

LINE OF BUSINESS	FIRE AND ALLIED		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
Independent	Florists' Mutual Insurance Company		-0.5
ISO/Independent	The Hanover Insurance Company		1.8
	Hanover Insurance Company of America Massachusetts Bay Insurance Company		
ISO/Independent	Sentry Insurance A Mutual Company Middlesex Insurance Company		5.1
	Patriot General Insurance Company		
ISO/Independent	Tri-State Insurance Company of Minnesota		5.4
ISO/Independent	Nationwide Insurance Companies		5.0
ISO/Independent	Selective Ins Co of America Selective Ins Co of South Carolina		-1.6 -1.6
	Selective Ins Co of the Southeast		-1.4
ISO/Independent	Great Midwest Ins Co		INITIAL
ISO/Independent	Liberty Mutual Group		0.0
ISO/Independent	Travelers Group		-0.5
Independent	Florists' Mutual Insurance Company		-18.7
ISO	Acadia Insurance Company		5.6
	Continental Western Insurance Company  Firemen's Ins. Co. of Washington D.C.		5.5 8.4
	Union Insurance Company		5.4
ISO	Hospitality Insurance Company		INITIAL

# **EXHIBIT- G**

LINE OF BUSINESS -	COMMERCIAL MULTI PERIL & BUSINESS OWNERS		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
ISO	Argonaut Ins Co		
INDEPENDENT	Travelers Cas. Ins. Co. of America		1.5
INDEPENDENT	Utical Mutual Insurance Co.		-0.2
	Graphic Arts Mutual Ins. Co.		
	Republic-Franklin Ins. Co.		
	Utica National Assurance Co.		
INDEPENDENT	Federated Mutual Ins. Co.		2.1
	Federated Service Ins. Co.		
INDEPENDENT	Vermont Mutual Insurance Co.		-19.9
INDEPENDENT	Main St. America Assurance Co.		1.1
INDEPENDENT	Markel Insurance Company		4.8
ISO/INDEPENDENT	EMCASCO Insurance Company		3.4
	Employers Mutual Casualty Co.		3.1
ISO/INDEPENDENT	Union Mutual Fire Ins. Company		-4.5
INDEPENDENT	The Hanover Insurance Co.		0.3
	The Hanover Ins. Co. of America		
	Massachusetts Bay Ins. Co.		
	Citizens Ins. Co. of America		
ISO/INDEPENDENT	Citizens Insurance Co. of America		6.7
INDEPENDENT	Foremost Ins. Co. Grand Rapids		-0.3
	Foremost Property Casualty Co.		
	Foremost Signature Ins. Co.		
INDEPENDENT	American Fire & Casualty Co.		3.6
	Ohio Casualty Insurance Co.		
	Ohio Security Insurance Co.		
	West American Insurance Co.		
INDEPENDENT	Utica Mutual Insurance Co.		8.7

	Graphic Arts Mutual Ins. Co.	
	Republic-Franklin Insurance Co.	
	Utica National Assurance Co.	
INDEPENDENT	Utica First Insurance Company	1.1
INDEPENDENT	Foremost Ins. Co. Grand Rapids	3.9
	Michigan	
	Foremost P&C Insurance Co.	
	Foremost Signature Ins. Co.	
INDEPENDENT	Middlesex Mutual Assurance Co.	-1.4
INDEPENDENT/AAIS	Pharmacists Mutual Ins. Co.	-2.8
INDEPENDENT	Travelers Cas. Ins. Co. of America	3.70%
INDEPENDENT/ISO	Allstate Insurance Company	3.70%
INDEPENDENT	Charter Oak Fire Insurance Co.	-4.10%
INDEPENDENT	Phoenix Insurance Company	-4.10%
	Travelers Indemnity Company	
	Travelers Ind. Co. of America	
	Travelers Ind. Co. of Connecticut	
	Travelers P/C Co. of America	
INDEPENDENT	Peerless Indemnity Ins. Co.	3.00%
	Peerless Insurance Company	
	Excelsior Insurance Company	
	The Netherlands Ins. Co.	
INDEPENDENT	Selective Ins. Co. of America	0.10%
	Selective Ins. Co. of S. Carolina	
	Selective Ins. Co. of Southeast	
INDEPENDENT	Nationwide Agribusiness Ins. Co.	8.60%
	Farmowners Operations	5.50%
ISO/INDEPENDENT	Allianz Insurance Group	-2.30%
NIDED TO THE		2.22
INDEPENDENT	Selective Ins. Co. Of America Selective Ins. Co. of S. Carolina	6.00%
	Selective Ins. Co. of S. Carolina Selective Ins. Co. of Southeast	
INDEDENDENT	Ctata Auta Inauranaa Camuraniaa	4.400/
INDEPENDENT	State Auto Insurance Companies	-1.40%
INDEPENDENT	United Ohio Insurance Company	5.40%

INDEPENDENT	American Cas. Co. of Reading PA	2.8%
	National Fire Ins. Co. of Hartford	3.4%
	Transportation Insurance Company	4.0%
	Valley Forge Insurance Company	3.7%
	Continental Casualty Company	3.9%
ISO/INDEPENDENT	Sentry Insurance A Mutual Co.	2.30%
	Middlesex Insurance Company	
	Patriot General Insurance Co.	
ISO	RLI Ins Co	Initial

# **EXHIBIT- H**

LINE OF BUSINESS -	INLAND MARINE		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
	NONE		

LINE OF BUSINESS -	BURGLARY AND THEFT		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
	NONE		

LINE OF BUSINESS -	BOILER AND MACHINERY		
ORGANIZATION	COMPANY NAME	YEAR 2016	RATE CHANGE
	NONE		

LINE OF BUSINESS	FIDELITY & SURETY	YEAR	
ORGANIZATION		2016	
INDEPENDENT	Sentry Select Insurance Company		*66.00%
	*Base premium increasing from \$100 to \$153		