

STATE OF CONNECTICUT

DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION



2800 BERLIN TURNPIKE, P.O. BOX 317546 NEWINGTON, CONNECTICUT 06131-7546 Phone:

(860) 594-2875

DOCKET NUMBER 1305-N-253-L

RE: APPLICATION OF AHMED N. BHATTI D.B.A. PRINCE LIVERY TO OPERATE ONE (1) MOTOR VEHICLE, HAVING A SEATING CAPACITY OF TEN (10) ADULTS OR LESS, IN GENERAL LIVERY SERVICE BETWEEN ALL POINTS IN CONNECTICUT FROM A HEADQUARTERS IN WINDSOR LOCKS.

FINAL DECISION

January 10, 2014

I. INTRODUCTION

A. General

By application filed on May 28, 2013, with the Department of Transportation (hereinafter "department"), pursuant to Section 13b-103 of the Connecticut General Statutes, as amended, Ahmed N. Bhatti d.b.a. Prince Livery (hereinafter "applicant") with a mailing address of 492 Ash Drive, Windsor, Connecticut 06096, seeks authorization to operate one (1) motor vehicle, having a seating capacity of ten (10) adults or less, in general livery service between all points in Connecticut from a headquarters in the town of Windsor Locks.

B. Hearing Held

Pursuant to Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-103, as amended, a public hearing on this application was held on December 17, 2013.

Notice of the application and of the hearing to be held thereon was given to the applicant and to such other parties as required pursuant to the Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-103. Legal notice to the public was given by publication on the department's website.

A hearing officer designated by the Commissioner, pursuant to Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-17, conducted the hearing on this matter.

C. Appearances

Ahmed Bhatti appeared on behalf of the applicant. The applicant was represented by Michael Stone, Esq. who has a mailing address is 129 Church Street, Suite 806, New Haven, Connecticut 06510.

II. FINDING OF FACTS

- 1. The applicant seeks to operate one (1) livery vehicle in intrastate livery service from a headquarters in Windsor Locks.
- 2. The applicant currently operates Best Cab, a taxicab service with one (1) taxicab that operates in the sixteen (16) towns which comprise the Greater Hartford Transit District. The applicant has held this authority since 2002.
- 3. Nefeesa Nasir is a customer of the applicant's taxicab service. She would prefer using the applicant's livery service over the taxi service if it was available. She has not been impressed by other livery services she has used. Her husband travels extensively to Ohio for business and he would also be interested in using the applicant's livery service. She quantified her livery usage at three (3) to four (4) times a year.

- 4. John Robert Larese is an engineer for Exxon Mobil. He travels extensively for work. He uses the applicant's taxicab service currently. Safety and reliability are essential to him and his company so he prefers to use the applicant as a driver but would rather travel by livery than taxi. He would be able to utilize the applicant's service once a month.
- 5. Mr. Bhatti has extensive transportation experience having driven limousines in New York for ten years.
- 6. The applicant has spoken with several drivers to help him in the new venture. He will also be driving the livery vehicle.
- 7. The applicant's expenses include \$3,759 annually for insurance, the monthly payment of \$228 on the car, \$1,000 for legal fees, communication expenses of \$200 a month, \$150 for business cards, property tax of \$360 and repairs of \$1250 a month.
- 8. The applicant's total assets of \$26,691 include a 2011 Toyota Camry with a fair market value of \$16,175 and cash of \$10,516.
 - 9. There was no opposition to this application.

III. DEPARTMENT ANALYSIS

The department has jurisdiction over each person, association, limited liability company or corporation owning or operating a motor vehicle in livery service, pursuant to Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-102, as amended.

In determining whether a livery permit should be granted, the department shall take into consideration the present or future public convenience and necessity. The applicant must prove that the public's convenience and necessity will be improved by the proposed service. Additionally, the applicant must show the suitability of the applicant or the suitability of the management if the applicant is a limited liability company or corporation, the financial responsibility of the applicant, the ability of the applicant efficiently and properly to perform the service for which authority is requested and the fitness, willingness and ability of the applicant to conform to the provisions of the statutes and the requirements and regulations of the department thereunder, in accordance with Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-103.

In support of financial wherewithal, the applicant has presented evidence that its expenses are as follows: annual insurance of \$3,759, a monthly vehicle payment of \$228, legal fees of \$1,000, communication expenses of \$200 a month, business cards of \$150, property tax of \$360 and repairs of \$1250 a month. The applicant's total assets of \$26,691 include a 2011 Toyota Camry with a fair market value of \$16,175 and cash of \$10,516. Based on the evidence presented, the applicant has proven the financial suitability to operate this livery service.

With regard to suitability, the applicant provided the requisite criminal conviction history form for Mr. Bhatti which shows no criminal record. The applicant currently operates a taxicab service with one (1) vehicle and has extensive livery experience having been a driver for over ten years. The applicant also appears to be able to efficiently and properly perform the service for which authority is requested and has knowledge of the rules and regulations.

The only negative issue that came up in the hearing is the applicant's ability to maintain an office for the livery business. It was explained to the applicant what elements were required regarding the maintenance of a livery office and the applicant said he could comply with those requirements. Based on the evidence presented, the applicant appears to be suitable to operate the proposed service.

The applicant is also required to prove public convenience and necessity. The applicant presented the testimony of two witnesses who support the application. Both witnesses testified that they are regular users of the applicant's taxicab service but would prefer using his livery service instead. Their experiences with past livery services have not been favorable and they know the quality of service the applicant would provide would be better based on their experience with his taxi service.

Based upon the above and pursuant to Connecticut General Statutes Section 13b-103, as amended, the application of Ahmed N. Bahatti d.b.a. Prince Livery is hereby granted and Livery Permit Number 3364 is issued as follows:

LIVERY PERMIT NO. 3364 FOR THE OPERATION OF LIVERY SERVICE

Ahmed N. Bhatti d.b.a Prince Livery is hereby permitted and authorized to operate one (1) motor vehicle, having a seating capacity of ten (10) adults or less, in general livery service from a headquarters in Windsor Locks to all points in Connecticut.

RESTRICTIONS:

The applicant must register the one (1) vehicle granted under this decision within sixty (60) days from the date of this decision.

The authority granted under this permit may not be sold or transferred until it has been operational, i.e. a vehicle registered with livery plates there under for not less than twenty-four (24) months.

This permit shall remain in effect until revoked by the department. Failure of the permit holder to maintain proper insurance and/or comply with all pertinent motor vehicle laws and other state statutes and/or the rules, regulations and orders of the department may from time to time prescribe thereunder.

A memorandum of this permit, bearing the seal of the department, shall be kept conspicuously posted in the motor vehicles operated under this permit.

Dated at Newington, Connecticut on this 10th day of January 2014.

CONNECTICUT DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

Judith Almeida Staff Attorney III

Administrative Law Unit

Bureau of Finance and Administration